

Application No. 10/711,584
Technology Center 1792
Reply dated January 12, 2009
In Response to Office Action dated September 10, 2008

REMARKS

As of the filing of the present reply, claims 1-19 were pending in the above-identified US Patent Application.

In the Office Action, the Examiner maintained an obviousness-type double patenting rejection of claims 1-19 over claims 1-20 of U.S. Patent No. 7,244,467 to Grossman et al., maintained a rejection of claims 1, 2, and 4-19 under 35 USC §103 as being unpatentable over Applicants' admitted prior art (AAPA) in view of Japanese patent JP 01-180959 A to Nakamura et al. (Nakamura) and U.S. Patent No. 6,153,313 to Rigney et al. (Rigney), and maintained a rejection of claim 3 under 35 USC §103 as unpatentable over the AAPA, Nakamura, and Rigney in further view of U.S. Patent No. to 6,375,425 to Lee et al. (Lee). Favorable reconsideration and allowance of claims 1-19 are respectfully requested in view of the following remarks.

Double Patenting Rejections

The Examiner explained that the double patenting rejection based on Grossman et al. was not overcome because Applicants' Terminal Disclaimer filed May 28, 2008, was not accepted. The explanation was that

Application No. 10/711,584
Technology Center 1792
Reply dated January 12, 2009
In Response to Office Action dated September 10, 2008

The disclaimer fee in accordance with 37 CFR 1.20(d) has not been submitted, nor is there an authorization in the application file to charge a specified Deposit Account or credit card.

Applicants respectfully disagree. The USPTO documents attached to this reply prove that the fee was submitted, accepted and deducted from the undersigned's Deposit Account on May 28, 2008.

Accordingly, Applicants again respectfully request withdrawal of the obviousness-type double patenting rejection.

Rejections under 35 USC §103

As noted above, the §103 rejections are based on the combination of the AAPA, Nakamura and Rigney alone or in further view of Lee.

In the "Response to Arguments" section of the Office Action, the Examiner explained that Applicants' arguments in the reply filed May 28, 2008, was unpersuasive because

(1) Applicants' "overlay coating is in fact a diffusion coating, where the applicant's specification clearly discloses that an overlay coating has a diffusion zone (see applicant's specification at paragraph 0005)," and

(2) "the Nakamura reference discloses that the treatment method enhances the resistance to thermal fatigue of the surface of a coating layer obtained by known coating treatments...."

Applicants respectfully request reconsideration.

The Examiner argues that an overlay coating is a diffusion coating because it shares certain characteristics of a diffusion coating, namely, a diffusion zone. However, the Examiner is certainly aware that the patent literature (of record and otherwise) contains numerous references to overlay coatings and diffusion coatings as two different types of coatings that are readily distinguishable in terms of microstructure, chemistry, properties, and how they are deposited. The art has adopted the names "overlay coating" and "diffusion coating" even though overlay coatings contain a diffusion zone and diffusion coatings have an overlay (additive) portion. Therefore, to argue that "the overlay coating is in fact a diffusion coating" is untenable, if not for the above reasons, then for the reason that these coatings are defined in paragraph [0005] of Applicants' specification. MPEP §2173.01.

Finally, the argument that one would be motivated to modify the AAPA on the grounds that "the Nakamura reference discloses that the

treatment method enhances the resistance to thermal fatigue of the surface of a coating layer" overlooks the fact that "NiAl overlay bond coats [have] higher creep resistance and flow or yield strengths at elevated temperatures" than diffusion aluminide bond coats. Paragraph [0009]. See also [0024], including Applicants' teaching that:

While various properties of coating, including microhardness, strength and plasticity, are known to be effected by microstructure, it is believed that the influence that microstructure might have on oxidation, which leads to TBC spallation, has not.

Because the yield strength of NiAl overlay coatings do not need to be improved, one skilled in the art would not look to Nakamura because Nakamura's teachings are specific to improving "the resistance to thermal fatigue of the surface of a coating layer." (See the three paragraphs on page 5 of the translation, and the section titled "Effect of the Invention" on page 12 of the translation.) Nakamura admittedly discusses corrosion resistance, but only to the extent that the disclosed treatment "obtain[s] a coating layer with good resistance to thermal fatigue without a loss in resistance to corrosion." (Paragraph bridging pages 7 and 8 of the translation; emphasis added.) Therefore, Nakamura provides absolutely no suggestion that oxidation

Application No. 10/711,584
Technology Center 1792
Reply dated January 12, 2009
In Response to Office Action dated September 10, 2008

resistance could be improved by recrystallization.

In view of the above remarks, Applicants believe that the combination of the AAPA and Nakamura, alone or in combination with Rigney and/or Lee, does not teach or suggest Applicants' claimed invention, and Applicants respectfully request withdrawal of the §103 rejections.

Closing

Should the Examiner have any questions with respect to any matter now of record, Applicants' representative may be reached at (219) 462-4999.

Respectfully submitted,



Domenica N.S. Hartman
Reg. No. 32,701

January 12, 2009
Hartman & Hartman, P.C.
Valparaiso, Indiana 46383
TEL.: (219) 462-4999
FAX: (219) 464-1166

Attachments: Copy of Electronic Acknowledgment Receipt; Copy of Terminal Disclaimer filed 5/28/08; Copy of Electronic Patent Application Fee Transmittal; Copy of Deposit Account Statement for May 2008

Electronic Acknowledgement Receipt

EFS ID:	3364359
Application Number:	10711584
International Application Number:	
Confirmation Number:	5583
Title of Invention:	BETA-PHASE NICKEL ALUMINIDE OVERLAY COATING AND PROCESS THEREFOR
First Named Inventor/Applicant Name:	Irene Spitsberg
Customer Number:	30952
Filer:	Domenica N. S. Hartman/Gayle Pietro
Filer Authorized By:	Domenica N. S. Hartman
Attorney Docket Number:	121492-3
Receipt Date:	28-MAY-2008
Filing Date:	27-SEP-2004
Time Stamp:	09:44:20
Application Type:	Utility under 35 USC 111(a)

Payment information:

Submitted with Payment	yes
Payment Type	Deposit Account
Payment was successfully received in RAM	\$130
RAM confirmation Number	15874
Deposit Account	080960
Authorized User	
The Director of the USPTO is hereby authorized to charge indicated fees and credit any overpayment as follows:	
Charge any Additional Fees required under 37 C.F.R. Section 1.21 (Miscellaneous fees and charges)	

File Listing:

Document Number	Document Description	File Name	File Size(Bytes) /Message Digest	Multi Part /.zip	Pages (if appl.)
1	Amendment - After Non-Final Rejection	A4-1828_Am_A.pdf	85042 eae785715dd470e8cdbe331ad237dfa a205402f	no	16

Warnings:**Information:**

2	Terminal Disclaimer Filed	121492-3-Terminal-Disclosure.pdf	79886 950x0@file=306a414755616b1a2d945 a5f61b0b	no	1
---	---------------------------	----------------------------------	---	----	---

Warnings:**Information:**

3	Fee Worksheet (PTO-06)	fee-info.pdf	8203 3d304244d5906910+91naa2b59f1560 c534767	no	2
---	------------------------	--------------	--	----	---

Warnings:**Information:****Total Files Size (in bytes):** 173131

This Acknowledgement Receipt evidences receipt on the noted date by the USPTO of the indicated documents, characterized by the applicant, and including page counts, where applicable. It serves as evidence of receipt similar to a Post Card, as described in MPEP 503.

New Applications Under 35 U.S.C. 111

If a new application is being filed and the application includes the necessary components for a filing date (see 37 CFR 1.53(b)-(d) and MPEP 506), a Filing Receipt (37 CFR 1.54) will be issued in due course and the date shown on this Acknowledgement Receipt will establish the filing date of the application.

National Stage of an International Application under 35 U.S.C. 371

If a timely submission to enter the national stage of an international application is compliant with the conditions of 35 U.S.C. 371 and other applicable requirements a Form PCT/DO/EO/903 indicating acceptance of the application as a national stage submission under 35 U.S.C. 371 will be issued in addition to the Filing Receipt, in due course.

New International Application Filed with the USPTO as a Receiving Office

If a new international application is being filed and the international application includes the necessary components for an international filing date (see PCT Article 11 and MPEP 1810), a Notification of the International Application Number and of the International Filing Date (Form PCT/RO/105) will be issued in due course, subject to prescriptions concerning national security, and the date shown on this Acknowledgement Receipt will establish the international filing date of the application.

TERMINAL DISCLAIMER TO OBVIAE A DOUBLE PATENTING REJECTION OVER A "PRIOR" PATENT		Docket Number (Optional) 121492-3
---	--	--------------------------------------

In re Application of: Irene Spitsberg et al.

Application No.: 10/711,584

Filed: September 27, 2004

For: BETA-PHASE NICKEL ALUMINIDE OVERLAY COATING AND PROCESS THEREFOR

The owner*, General Electric Company, of 100 percent interest in the instant application hereby disclaims, except as provided below, the terminal part of the statutory term of any patent granted on the instant application which would extend beyond the expiration date of the full statutory term prior patent No. 7,244,467 as the term of said prior patent is defined in 35 U.S.C. 154 and 173, and as the term of said prior patent is presently shortened by any terminal disclaimer. The owner hereby agrees that any patent so granted on the instant application shall be enforceable only for and during such period that it and the prior patent are commonly owned. This agreement runs with any patent granted on the instant application and is binding upon the grantee, its successors or assigns.

In making the above disclaimer, the owner does not disclaim the terminal part of the term of any patent granted on the instant application that would extend to the expiration date of the full statutory term as defined in 35 U.S.C. 154 and 173 of the prior patent, "as the term of said prior patent is presently shortened by any terminal disclaimer," in the event that said prior patent later expires for failure to pay a maintenance fee;

- is held unenforceable;
- is found invalid by a court of competent jurisdiction;
- is statutorily disclaimed in whole or terminally disclaimed under 37 CFR 1.321;
- has all claims canceled by a reexamination certificate;
- is reissued, or
- is in any manner terminated prior to the expiration of its full statutory term as presently shortened by any terminal disclaimer.

Check either box 1 or 2 below, if appropriate.

1. For submissions on behalf of a business/organization (e.g., corporation, partnership, university, government agency, etc.), the undersigned is empowered to act on behalf of the business/organization.

I hereby declare that all statements made herein of my own knowledge are true and that all statements made on information and belief are believed to be true, and further that these statements were made with the knowledge that willful false statements and the like so made are punishable by fine or imprisonment, or both, under Section 1001 of Title 18 of the United States Code and that such willful false statements may jeopardize the validity of the application or any patent issued thereon.

2. The undersigned is an attorney or agent of record. Reg. No. 32,721

/Domenica N.S. Hartman/

Signature

May 27, 2008

Date

Domenica N.S. Hartman

Typed or printed name

(219) 462-4999

Telephone Number

- Terminal disclaimer fee under 37 CFR 1.20(d) included.

WARNING: Information on this form may become public. Credit card information should not be included on this form. Provide credit card information and authorization on PTO-2038.

*Statement under 37 CFR 3.73(b) is required if terminal disclaimer is signed by the assignee (owner). Form PTO/SB/06 may be used for making this certification. See MPEP § 324.

This collection of information is required by 37 CFR 1.221. The information is required to obtain or retain a benefit by the public which is to file (and by the USPTO to process) an application. Confidentiality is guaranteed by 36 U.S.C. 122 and 37 CFR 1.11 and 1.14. This collection is estimated to take 12 minutes to complete, including gathering, preparing, and submitting the completed application form to the USPTO. Time will vary depending upon the individual case. Any comments on the amount of time you require to complete this form and/or suggestions for reducing this burden, should be sent to the Chief Information Officer, U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, U.S. Department of Commerce, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, VA 22313-1450. DO NOT SEND FEES OR COMPLETED FORMS TO THIS ADDRESS. SEND TO: Commissioner for Patents, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, VA 22313-1450.

Electronic Patent Application Fee Transmittal

Application Number:	10711584			
Filing Date:	27-Sep-2004			
Title of Invention:	BETA-PHASE NICKEL ALUMINIDE OVERLAY COATING AND PROCESS THEREFOR			
First Named Inventor/Applicant Name:	Irene Spitsberg			
Filer:	Domenica N. S. Hartman/Gayle Pietro			
Attorney Docket Number:	121492-3			
Filed as Large Entity				
Utility Filing Fees				
Description	Fee Code	Quantity	Amount	Sub-Total in USD(\$)
Basic Filing:				
Pages:				
Claims:				
Miscellaneous-Filing:				
Petition:				
Petition fee- 37 CFR 1.17(h) (Group III)	1464	1	130	130
Patent-Appeals-and-Interference:				
Post-Allowance-and-Post-Issuance:				
Extension-of-Time:				

Description	Fee Code	Quantity	Amount	Sub-Total in USD(\$)
Miscellaneous:				
Total in USD (\$)				130



**United States
Patent and
Trademark Office**

Search
USPTO
Home
Page

Finance
Online
Shopping
Page

Deposit Account Statement

Requested Statement Month: May 2008
 Deposit Account Number: 080960
 Name: HARTMAN & HARTMAN P C
 Attention: DOMENICA N.S. HARTMAN
 Street Address 1: 552 EAST 700 NORTH
 Street Address 2:
 City: VALPARAISO
 State: IN
 Zip: 46383
 Country: UNITED STATES

DATE SEQ	POSTING REF TXT	ATTORNEY DOCKET NBR	FEE CODE	AMT	BAL
05/01 1023	29317474	A8-2488	2012	\$105.00	\$1,973.54
05/01 1024	29317474	A8-2488	2112	\$50.00	\$1,923.54
05/01 1025	29317474	A8-2488	2312	\$65.00	\$1,858.54
05/01 14637	10711841	A4-1845	2251	\$60.00	\$1,798.54
05/02 998	61049555	A8-2512	2005	\$105.00	\$1,693.54
05/02 11487	61049876	A8-2498	2005	\$105.00	\$1,588.54
05/02 11761	11763806	225252-1	8007	\$60.00	\$1,528.54
05/05 1	PCT/US08/57584	A7-2356-PCT	1705	-\$171.00	\$1,699.54
05/05 2	PCT/US08/57584	A7-2356-PCT	1606	-\$750.00	\$2,449.54
05/05 3	PCT/US07/19778	A7-2356-PCT	1705	\$171.00	\$2,278.54
05/05 4	PCT/US07/19778	A7-2356-PCT	1606	\$750.00	\$1,528.54
05/05 5	PCT/US07/19778	A7-2356-PCT	1462	\$400.00	\$1,128.54
05/05 2	PCT/US07/05131		9204	-\$40.00	\$1,168.54
05/05 3	PCT/US08/61736	A8-2479-PCT	8007	-\$40.00	\$1,208.54
05/05 9142	12103988	A8-2491	8021	\$40.00	\$1,168.54
05/07 11023	12103988	A8-2491	2051	\$65.00	\$1,103.54
05/07 11371	12101697	A8-2492	2051	\$65.00	\$1,038.54
05/08 1031	E-REPLENISHMENT		9203	-\$2,000.00	\$3,038.54
05/08 106	29243228	A7-2381	2502	\$410.00	\$2,628.54
05/08 107	29243228	A7-2381	8001	\$30.00	\$2,598.54
05/08 16	PCT/US08/61976	A8-2500-PCT	1703	\$91.00	\$2,507.54
05/08 17	PCT/US08/61976	A8-2500-PCT	8007	-\$80.00	\$2,587.54
05/13 5968	11564639	201460	1801	\$810.00	\$1,777.54
05/13 9517	61015722	A7-2407	8021	\$40.00	\$1,737.54
05/13 85	11276904	A8-2058	2251	\$60.00	\$1,677.54
05/14 1791	E-REPLENISHMENT		9203	-\$2,000.00	\$3,677.54
05/14 2229	6152257	99-1034	2552	\$1,180.00	\$2,497.54
05/14 11994	12107445	A8-2460	8021	\$40.00	\$2,457.54
05/14 12287	12107445	A8-2460	2051	\$65.00	\$2,392.54
05/15 6039	77474783	A8-2506	7001	\$325.00	\$2,067.54
05/16 1861	11635342	213975-1 (G20-0024)	1202	\$150.00	\$1,917.54
05/16 1862	11635342	213975-1 (G20-0024)	1801	\$810.00	\$1,107.54

05/16 13090 12098668	187578	1111	\$510.00	\$597.54
05/16 13091 12098668	187578	1311	\$210.00	\$387.54
05/16 13092 12098668	187578	1051	\$130.00	\$257.54
05/19 2428 E-REPLENISHMENT		9203	-\$2,000.00	\$2,257.54
05/20 11561 29317474	A8-2488	8021	\$40.00	\$2,217.54
05/20 11644 29317474	A8-2488	2051	\$65.00	\$2,152.54
05/20 11839 12108543	129284	1051	\$130.00	\$2,022.54
05/21 7808 12106642	A8-2515	8021	\$40.00	\$1,982.54
05/21 7840 12106642	A8-2505	2051	\$65.00	\$1,917.54
05/21 11229 10710895	13DV-13975-4	1464	\$130.00	\$1,787.54
05/22 10530 29306970	A8-2497	2051	\$65.00	\$1,722.54
05/23 5 12066332	A8-2475	2632	-\$255.00	\$1,977.54
05/23 6 12066332	A8-2475	2642	\$205.00	\$1,772.54
05/27 13845 12127133	A8-2456	4011	\$75.00	\$1,697.54
05/27 13846 12127133	A8-2456	2111	\$255.00	\$1,442.54
05/27 13847 12127133	A8-2456	2311	\$105.00	\$1,337.54
05/28 16514 E-REPLENISHMENT		9203	-\$2,000.00	\$3,337.54
05/28 17346 PCT/US08/64870	A8-2456-PCT	1601	\$300.00	\$3,037.54
05/28 17347 PCT/US08/64870	A8-2456-PCT	1702	\$1,263.00	\$1,774.54
05/28 17348 PCT/US08/64870	A8-2456-PCT	1709	\$244.00	\$1,530.54
05/28 17349 PCT/US08/64870	A8-2456-PCT	8007	\$20.00	\$1,510.54
05/28 26017 10711584	121492-3	1464	\$130.00	\$1,380.54
05/29 10546 10906886	A4-1869	2202	\$125.00	\$1,255.54
05/29 10547 10906886	A4-1869	2251	\$60.00	\$1,195.54

START BALANCE	SUM OF CHARGES	SUM OF REPLENISH	END BALANCE
\$2,078.54	\$10,219.00	\$9,336.00	\$1,195.54

Need Help? | USPTO Home Page | Finance Online Shopping Page